ransport properties of the QCD medium









In this talk

- Recent developments in the microscopic description of kinetic and transport properties of the quark gluon plasma
 - Medium-induced radiation
 - Transverse momentum broadening
 - The effective kinetic theory, transport&thermalisation
- Main driver: better understanding&control of theory and its uncertainties



here. I refer to the original contributions

Many interesting developments and results, limited sample presented





- Key ingredient
 - in the description of jet modification, see J. Brewer's talk
 - *thermalisation* Baier Mueller Schiff Son (2001)

• in thermalisation&transport: effective number-violating $1 \leftrightarrow 2$ process, efficient chemical equilibration and energy transport, bottom-up

$$\frac{dI}{dx} = \frac{\alpha_s P_{1 \to 2}(x)}{[x(1-x)E]^2} \operatorname{Re} \int_{t_1 < t_2} dt_1 dt_2 \nabla_{\boldsymbol{b}_2} \cdot \nabla_{\boldsymbol{b}_1} \left[\left\langle \boldsymbol{b}_2, t_2 | \boldsymbol{b}_1, t_1 \right\rangle |_{\boldsymbol{b}_2 = \boldsymbol{b}_1 = 0} - \operatorname{vac.} \right]$$

• Probability I: vacuum DGLAP x emission vertices x transverse diffusion

Baier Dokshitzer Mueller Peigne Schiff, Zakharov (1995-97)



• Probability I: vacuum DGLAP x emission vertices x transverse diffusion

$$\frac{dI}{dx} = \frac{\alpha_s P_{1 \to 2}(x)}{[x(1-x)E]^2} \operatorname{Re} \int_{t_1 < t_2} dt_1 dt_2$$

 Transverse diffusion under this Hamiltonian

 $\mathcal{H} = -\frac{\nabla_{\boldsymbol{b}}^2}{2x(1-x)E} + \sum_i \frac{m^2}{2E_i} - i\mathcal{C}(\boldsymbol{b}, x\boldsymbol{b}, (1-x)\boldsymbol{b})$

Real part: phase accumulation (with in-medium masses)

Imaginary part: Wilson lines encoding *scattering kernel* with the medium

Baier Dokshitzer Mueller Peigne Schiff, Zakharov (1995-97)





- In practice, most approaches resorted to limiting regimes
 - Opacity expansion, for *thin media* Gyulassy Levai Vitev (2000)
 - Harmonic oscillator approximation, for thick media, introduce \hat{q} Diffusion under *multiple soft scatterings*
 - $\mathcal{C}(\boldsymbol{b}, x\boldsymbol{b}, (1-x)\boldsymbol{b}) \approx \frac{q}{\Lambda}$
 - Infinite, time-independent medium Arnold Moore Yaffe (2002)



$$\frac{\hat{q}}{4} \left[b^2 + (xb)^2 + ((1-x)b)^2 \right]$$

• Consider for simplicity the broadening of a single parton:



Broadening probability

$$\mathcal{P}(k_{\perp}) = \int_{\boldsymbol{b}} e^{-i\boldsymbol{k}_{\perp}\cdot\boldsymbol{b}} \exp\left[-\mathcal{C}(\boldsymbol{b})L\right]$$











• Consider for simplicity the broadening of a single parton:



Broadening probability

$$\mathcal{P}(k_{\perp}) = \int_{\boldsymbol{b}} e^{-i\boldsymbol{k}_{\perp}\cdot\boldsymbol{b}} \exp\left[-\mathcal{C}(\boldsymbol{b})L\right]$$

Barata Mehtar-Tani Soto-Ontoso Tywoniuk **PRD104** (2021) **Posters** by **Barata**, **Takacs**, **Tywoniuk** Wednesday







- Consider for simplicity the broadening of a single parton: $\mathcal{C}(b, \mathcal{B}, \mathcal{O}, \mathcal{$
- Broadening probability

$$\mathcal{P}(k_{\perp}) = \int_{\boldsymbol{b}} e^{-i\boldsymbol{k}_{\perp}\cdot\boldsymbol{b}} \exp\left[-\mathcal{C}(\boldsymbol{b})L\right]$$

• IR Gaussian from multiple soft scatterings $\mathcal{P}(k_{\perp})_{\mathrm{HO}} \propto \exp\left(-rac{k_{\perp}^2}{\hat{q}L}
ight)$



Barata Mehtar-Tani Soto-Ontoso Tywoniuk **PRD104** (2021) **Posters** by **Barata**, **Takacs**, **Tywoniuk** Wednesday





- Consider for simplicity the broadening of a single parton: $\mathcal{C}(b, \mathcal{B}, \mathcal{O}, \mathcal{$
- Broadening probability

$$\mathcal{P}(k_{\perp}) = \int_{\boldsymbol{b}} e^{-i\boldsymbol{k}_{\perp}\cdot\boldsymbol{b}} \exp\left[-\mathcal{C}(\boldsymbol{b})L\right]$$

- IR Gaussian from multiple soft scatterings ${\cal P}(k_{\perp})_{
 m HO} \propto \exp\left(-rac{k_{\perp}^2}{\hat{a}L}
 ight)$
- **asymptotic freedom** ⇒ it has to make way to the rare large momentum scatterings $\mathcal{P}(k_{\perp})_{\text{Coulomb}} \propto \frac{\alpha_s^2 T^3 L}{I^4}$

Barata Mehtar-Tani Soto-Ontoso Tywoniuk **PRD104** (2021) **Posters** by **Barata**, **Takacs**, **Tywoniuk** Wednesday







• **Improved harmonic oscillator approximation (IHO or IOE)**: $\mathcal{C} = \mathcal{C}_{\mathrm{HO}} + \left[\mathcal{C} - \mathcal{C}_{\mathrm{HO}} \right]$ $\mathcal{C}(\boldsymbol{b}, \boldsymbol{x}\boldsymbol{b}, (1-\boldsymbol{x})\boldsymbol{b}) \approx \frac{q}{\Lambda} \left[b^2 + (\boldsymbol{x}b)^2 + ((1-\boldsymbol{x})b)^2 \right] \equiv \mathcal{C}_{\mathrm{HO}}$ $\propto b^2 \ln(b),\ldots$

scatterings



Inclusion of Molière scattering in hybrid framework: talk by Hulcher Tue 18:30

- Treat the non-quadratic part of the kernel as a perturbation, properly incorporating the Coulomb logarithm: includes the rarer harder "Molière"

Barata Mehtar-Tani Soto-Ontoso Tywoniuk **JHEP2109** (2021) **Posters** by **Barata**, **Takacs**, **Tywoniuk** Wednesday



























Andres Apolinario Dominguez JHEP2007 (2020) Andres Dominguez Gonzalez-Martinez JHEP2103 (2021) Applications to time-dependent media in the talk by Andres, Wed 16:40 See also Caron-Huot Gale PRC82 (2010)

• Numerical determination of the Green's function of the full Hamiltonian



Numerical

IOE

HO

GLV N=1







• Classical (soft gluon) corrections to the scattering/broadening kernel can be problematic for perturbation theory, Linde problem







- Classical (soft gluon) corrections to the scattering/broadening kernel can be problematic for perturbation theory, Linde problem
- Breakthrough: soft classical modes at space-like separations become Euclidean and time-independent Caron-Huot PRD79 (2008)





- Classical (soft gluon) corrections to the scattering/broadening kernel can be problematic for perturbation theory, Linde problem
- Breakthrough: soft classical modes at space-like separations become Euclidean and time-independent Caron-Huot PRD79 (2008)
- Horrible HTL perturbative calculation or extremely challenging 4D lattice on the light-cone become **3D** Electrostatic QCD (EQCD). New strategy: lattice for $b \ge 1/gT$, pQCD for $b \le 1/gT$

 $n_B(p) \sim T/p \gtrsim 1/q$









- Classical (soft gluon) corrections to the scattering/broadening kernel can be problematic for perturbation theory, Linde problem
- Breakthrough: soft classical modes at space-like separations become Euclidean and time-independent Caron-Huot PRD79 (2008)
- Horrible HTL perturbative calculation or extremely challenging 4D lattice on the light-cone become **3D** Electrostatic QCD (EQCD). b New strategy: lattice for $b \ge 1/gT$, pQCD for $b \le 1/gT$
- Recently: continuum-extrapolated EQCD lattice data for the scattering kernel and merging with pQCD Moore Schlusser PRD101 (2020) Moore Schlichting Schlusser Soudi **JHEP2110** (2021)

 $n_B(p) \sim T/p \gtrsim 1/g$









The scattering kernel



- LO and NLO perturbative EQCD: Aurenche Gelis Zaraket (2002) Caron-Huot (2008)LO UV ($q \ge gT$) pQCD and matching: Arnold Xiao (2008) JG Kim (2018)
 - Significant deviations from pQCD
- Non-perturbative magnetic "screening" means q^{-3} instead of Coulomb/Molière q^{-4}
- qhat second moment of this quantity

$$\hat{q} \propto \int d^2 q_\perp \, q_\perp^2 \, \mathcal{C}(q_\perp)$$

Schlichting Soudi 2111.13731, talk by Soudi Thu 12:50





Medium-induced radiation from the EQCD kernel



from the more sophisticated approximations to the LPM equation

(Numerical) splitting rate with the non-perturbative broadening kernel



Differences from the broadening kernel more important than differences Schlichting Soudi 2111.13731, talk by Soudi Thu 12:50



The scattering kernel



- - Similar lattice EQCD+pQCD programme in progress for the in-medium jet mass Talk by Schicho, Wed 9:20
 - Only classical corrections here, what happens with **quantum corrections** for $q \ge gT$?

Schlichting Soudi 2111.13731, talk by Soudi Thu 12:50



logarithms in the single scattering regime \Rightarrow double logarithm

$$\delta \hat{q} = \frac{\alpha_s N_c}{\pi} \hat{q}_0 \int_{\text{single}}$$

Liou Mueller Wu (2013) Blaizot Dominguez Iancu Mehtar-Tani (2013)

Radiative corrections to momentum broadening are enhanced by soft and collinear

$$\frac{d\omega}{\omega}\frac{dk_{\perp}^2}{k_{\perp}^2} = \frac{\alpha_s N_c}{\pi}\hat{q}_0 \ln^2\left(\frac{L}{\tau_0}\right)$$



Caucal Mehtar-Tani 2109.12041 2203.09407 **Poster** by **Mehtar-Tani** later today

• Radiative corrections to momentum broadening are enhanced by soft and collinear logarithms in the single scattering regime \Rightarrow double logarithm

$$\delta \hat{q} = \frac{\alpha_s N_c}{\pi} \hat{q}_0 \int_{\text{single}}$$

Liou Mueller Wu (2013) Blaizot Dominguez Iancu Mehtar-Tani (2013)

• This log² renormalises the LO qhat. *Resum* these logs

$$\hat{q}(\tau, \mathbf{k}_{\perp}^{2}) = \hat{q}^{(0)}(\tau_{0}, \mathbf{k}_{\perp}^{2}) + \int_{\tau_{0}}^{\tau} \frac{\mathrm{d}\tau'}{\tau'} \int_{Q_{s}^{2}(\tau')}^{\mathbf{k}_{\perp}^{2}} \frac{\mathrm{d}\mathbf{k}_{\perp}'^{2}}{\mathbf{k}_{\perp}'^{2}} \ \bar{\alpha}_{s}(\mathbf{k}_{\perp}'^{2}) \ \hat{q}(\tau', \mathbf{k}_{\perp}'^{2}) = \hat{q}(\tau, Q_{s}^{2}(\tau))\tau ,$$

by solving the above numerically and semi-analytically

- $\int_{\text{gle}} \frac{d\omega}{\omega} \frac{dk_{\perp}^2}{k_{\perp}^2} = \frac{\alpha_s N_c}{\pi} \hat{q}_0 \ln^2 \left(\frac{L}{\tau_0}\right)$

- \$X00(au_0
- Single hard scattering $k'^2 \gg \hat{q}\tau$
- $m{k}_{ot}^{\prime 2})$ • UV cutoff
 - Shortest duration τ_0
- Caucal Mehtar-Tani 2109.12041 2203.09407 **Poster** by **Mehtar-Tani** later today





Radiative corrections to momentum broadening are enhanced by soft and collinear logarithms in the single scattering regime \Rightarrow double logarithm

$$\delta \hat{q} = \frac{\alpha_s N_c}{\pi} \hat{q}_0 \int_{\text{single}}$$

Liou Mueller Wu (2013) Blaizot Dominguez Iancu Mehtar-Tani (2013)

• This log² renormalises the LO qhat. *Resum* these logs

$$\hat{q}(\tau, \mathbf{k}_{\perp}^{2}) = \hat{q}^{(0)}(\tau_{0}, \mathbf{k}_{\perp}^{2}) + \int_{\tau_{0}}^{\tau} \frac{\mathrm{d}\tau'}{\tau'} \int_{Q_{s}^{2}(\tau')}^{\mathbf{k}_{\perp}^{2}} \frac{\mathrm{d}\mathbf{k}_{\perp}'^{2}}{\mathbf{k}_{\perp}'^{2}} \ \bar{\alpha}_{s}(\mathbf{k}_{\perp}'^{2}) \ \hat{q}(\tau', \mathbf{k}_{\perp}'^{2}) = \hat{q}(\tau, Q_{s}^{2}(\tau))\tau ,$$

by solving the above numerically and semi-analytically

- $\frac{d\omega}{\omega}\frac{dk_{\perp}^{2}}{k_{\perp}^{2}} = \frac{\alpha_{s}N_{c}}{\pi}\hat{q}_{0}\ln^{2}\left(\frac{L}{\tau_{0}}\right)$





 \overrightarrow{O}

 au_0

Caucal Mehtar-Tani 2109.12041 2203.09407 **Poster** by **Mehtar-Tani** later today





Caucal Mehtar-Tani 2109.12041 2203.09407 **Poster** by **Mehtar-Tani** later today

• Non-local nature of quantum radiative corrections makes Coulomb/Molière tail less steep

 ${\cal P} \propto k_{\perp}^{-4+2ar{lpha}_s}$ $\bar{\alpha}_s \equiv \frac{\alpha_s N_c}{\pi}$

Increased probability of largemomentum scatterings from non-local quantum corrections







Medium-induced radiation: quantum corrections

overlapping formation time in the soft limit Blaizot Mehtar-Tani, Iancu, Wu (2014)

• Universality of double logs: they also arise in the case of a **double splitting** with formation times





Medium-induced radiation: quantum corrections

- overlapping formation time in the soft limit Blaizot Mehtar-Tani, Iancu, Wu (2014)
- Arnold Iqbal Chang Gorda Rase Elgeadwy (2015-2022)

Arnold Iqbal Gorda 2112.05161 Arnold JHEP2203 (2021) **Poster** by **Iqbal** later today

• Universality of double logs: they also arise in the case of a **double splitting** with formation times



• Ongoing effort to determine all corrections from overlapping formation times (*real* and *virtual*) within the harmonic oscillator approximation. Important to understand if assumed Markovian nature of medium-induced kernel holds for the cascades



Medium-induced radiation: quantum corrections

- overlapping formation time in the soft limit Blaizot Mehtar-Tani, Iancu, Wu (2014)
- Arnold Iqbal Chang Gorda Rase Elgeadwy (2015-2022)
- for the accompanying single logs. Good news for their *resummation*!

• Universality of double logs: they also arise in the case of a **double splitting** with formation times



• Ongoing effort to determine all corrections from overlapping formation times (*real* and *virtual*) within the harmonic oscillator approximation. Important to understand if assumed Markovian nature of medium-induced kernel holds for the cascades

• Latest news: universality holds not only for the double logs, but (with caveats) also

Arnold Iqbal Gorda 2112.05161 Arnold JHEP2203 (2021) **Poster** by **Iqbal** later today



• Transverse momentum broadening and radiation are key ingredients in the *effective* kinetic theory of QCD, together with drag, longitudinal momentum broadening and conversions Arnold Moore Yaffe (2003)











- conversions Arnold Moore Yaffe (2003)
- Applications to jet physics: by **Soudi** Wednesday poster by Dai Wednesday Ke Wang JHEP2105 (2021), talk by Ke Thursday 17:30

• Transverse momentum broadening and radiation are key ingredients in the *effective* kinetic theory of QCD, together with drag, longitudinal momentum broadening and

AMY kinetic theory for jet thermalisation: Schlichting Soudi JHEP2107 (2021), poster

Factorised energy loss transport approach Dai Paquet Teaney Bass PRC105 (2022),





conversions Arnold Moore Yaffe (2003)

• How do these developments affect the kinetic description?

• Transverse momentum broadening and radiation are key ingredients in the *effective* kinetic theory of QCD, together with drag, longitudinal momentum broadening and





• Shear viscosity: efficiency of isotropisation is key







- Shear viscosity: efficiency of isotropisation is key
- Direct isotropizing effect of transverse momentum broadening thus more important than its indirect effect as a driver of medium-induced radiation







- Shear viscosity: efficiency of isotropisation is key
- Direct isotropizing effect of transverse momentum broadening thus more important than its indirect effect as a driver of medium-induced radiation
- From NLO corrections to broadening, radiation, drag&diffusion and conversion, get (almost) NLO shear JG Moore Teaney (2018)





- Shear viscosity: efficiency of isotropisation is key
- Direct isotropizing effect of transverse momentum broadening thus more important than its indirect effect as a driver of medium-induced radiation
- From NLO corrections to broadening, radiation, drag&diffusion and conversion, get (almost) NLO shear JG Moore Teaney (2018)
- NLO large and completely dominated by NLO broadening

LO 10 NLO w. gain 8 \cdots LO + NLO \hat{q} $g^4\eta/s$ 6 4 20 0.51.52 $\left(\right)$ m_D/T

 α_s : 0.03

0.1

0.2





- NLO large and completely dominated by NLO broadening
- Important observation: are we severely underestimating broadening at LO (excess screening shown before) and thus overestimating $\eta \sim 1/\hat{q}$? Müller **PRD104 (2021)**
- Get as much non-perturbative input as possible!



For a different way of merging pQCD and (4D) lattice see **D. Bala's poster** Wednesday for the photon rate, L. Altenkort's talk Wed 12:10 for heavy-quark diffusion





- Many applications of kinetic theory to thermalisation
- AMY at finite chemical potential and beam-energy dependence Schlichting Du PRL127, PRD104 (2021) Poster by X. Du Wednesday



Critical exponents in bottom-up thermalisation 2203.02299, poster by Scheihing-Hitschfeld



. . .

Attractors in kinetic theory talks by Plumari and Almalool Tuesday ~18

• We can worry about similarly problematic perturbative expansions for applications of kinetic theory to thermalisation. Can we try to estimate the systematics of typical **extrapolations** to $\alpha_s=0.3$ (g=2)?

Brewer Scheihing-Hitschfeld Yin 2203.02427, Mikheev Mazeliauskas Berges



• Recently, NLO corrections to isotropic thermalisation for overoccupied and



underoccupied initial conditions Fu JG Iqbal Kurkela PRD105 (2022), talk by Fu Wed 9:20



• Recently, NLO corrections to isotropic thermalisation for overoccupied and underoccupied initial conditions Fu JG Iqbal Kurkela PRD105 (2022), talk by Fu Wed 9:20



• Two different NLO schemes which resum differently higher-order effects: proxy for NNLO



• Recently, NLO corrections to isotropic thermalisation for overoccupied and



• Robust behaviour but in this case no isotropizing effect of transverse momentum broadening

underoccupied initial conditions Fu JG Iqbal Kurkela PRD105 (2022), talk by Fu Wed 9:20





- Yet another (classical) complication arises in the IR in the case of anisotropies: plasma instabilities Mrowczynski, Romatschke Strickland, Arnold Lenaghan Moore
- Recently, instability subtracted momentum broadening kernel, together with a recipe for dealing with the instabilities, was provided in Hauksson Jeon Gale PRC105 (2022). Poster by Hauksson Wednesday also discusses anisotropy effects on jet
- Anisotropy found to *reduce* the scattering kernel in the QGP phase. An important step towards a comprehensive kinetic treatment of anisotropic plasmas, work in progress



Czajka and Schuh Wednesday, talk by Carrington Thursday 11:30

Large&anisotropic transverse momentum broadening in the glasma, posters by



Conclusions

- Many recent improvements in the determination of transverse momentum broadening and medium-induced radiation in the QCD plasma are instrumental in better quantifying theory uncertainties and narrowing the gap between Lagrangians and phenomenology
 - Improved approximations and numerical solutions for the radiation rates
 - Non-perturbative determination of the broadening kernel
 - Quantum corrections: anomalous diffusion and double splitting
 - Improved understanding of the systematics of extrapolations to intermediate couplings for transport&thermalisation
- LOts and (N)LOts of progress, (N)LOts and (NN?)LOts and lat(tices) still to do







Istropic thermalisation at NLO

Ghiglieri, Moore, Teaney 1509.07773

- - For $2 \rightarrow 2$: soft gluon legs or soft gluon loops.



- For $1 \leftrightarrow 2$:

Slide from Y. Fu's talk Wed 9:20

O(g) corrections come from soft gluon:



• one-loop soft scatterings from the medium;

• wider-angle semi-collinear radiation.

We can construct collision operators that are equivalent up to NLO, with ambiguities at NNLO. (A general property of kinetic theory resummations.)

• use different results arising from these collision operators and their spread from LO to estimate of the uncertainty of NLO corrections.



Istropic thermalisation at NLO



NLO qualitatively similar to LO:(LO: Kurkela, Lu 1405.6318)

Slide from Y. Fu's talk Wed 9:20

> • the hard particles lose energy through the radiational cascade heating the soft thermal bath;

• the system thermalizes as the hard particles are quenched in the thermal bath.

Istropic thermalisation at NLO



Slide from Y. Fu's talk Wed 9:20

- NLO qualitatively similar to LO:(LO: Kurkela, Lu 1405.6318)
 - self-similar direct energy cascade to UV.



The photon rate and the 4D lattice

Polynomial ansatz of the s

J. Ghiglieri, O. Kaczmarek, M. Laine, For $\omega < \omega_0$

$$\rho_{fit}^{H} = \frac{\beta(\omega_{0})\omega^{3}}{2\omega_{0}^{3}} \left(5 - 3\frac{\omega^{2}}{\omega_{0}^{2}}\right) - \frac{\gamma(\omega_{0})\omega^{3}}{2\omega_{0}^{2}} \left(1 - \frac{\omega^{2}}{\omega_{0}^{2}}\right) + \left(\delta_{0}\left(\frac{\omega}{\omega_{0}}\right) + \delta_{1}\left(\frac{\omega}{\omega_{0}}\right)^{3}\right) \left(1 - \frac{\omega^{2}}{\omega_{0}^{2}}\right)^{2}$$

Slide courtesy of D. Bala

See also Cè Harris Meyer Steinberg Toniato **PRD102** (2020)

- For $\omega > \omega_0$, NLO-LPM re-summed spectral function has been used.
- β and γ is determined from the perturbative spectral function at ω_0 .
- of δ_1 to satisfy,

$$\int_0^\infty d\omega\,\omega$$

M. Ce et al. Phys. Rev. D 102, 091501(R)

• The ω_0 should be chosen deep into the time-like region $\omega_0 = \sqrt{k^2 + (\pi T)^2}$.

 D_{eff} from T - L correlator

spectral function
$$\rho_H(\omega, \vec{k}) = 2(\rho_T(\omega, \vec{k}) - \rho_L(\omega, \vec{k}))$$
,
and F. Meyer, Phys. Rev. D 94, 016005.

G. Jackson & M. Laine, J. High Energy. Phys. 2019, 144

• The parameter δ_0 is determined in terms

$$ho_{H}(\omega, \vec{k}) = 0$$

• The lattice T - L correlator is fitted with respect to δ_1 for light quark at $1.5T_c$ in SU(3) plasma.

Bala, Jackson, Kaczmarek (Poster).



1/2



The photon rate and the 4D lattice

Slide courtesy of D. Bala

See also Cè Harris Meyer Steinberg Toniato **PRD102** (2020)



Bala, Jackson, Kaczmarek (Poster).

- functions.

• Low- ω part of the spectral function is estimated from lattice data.

• Effective diffusion coefficient $D_{eff}(k) = \frac{\rho_H(|\vec{k}|,\vec{k})}{2\chi_q|\vec{k}|}$ calculated from these spectral

• The statistical error on D_{eff} is much smaller than the systematic uncertainty which has been obtained by varying ω_0 between $\sqrt{k^2 + (\pi T)^2}$ and $\sqrt{k^2 + (2\pi T)^2}$.

• At smaller momentum the D_{eff} differs from the perturbative estimate.

